

2a). How did the presentation at the Cliometrics Conference help your work?

The comments were very useful in revising the paper. I received lots of suggestions for improving the analysis and alternative ways of interpreting the results. I especially liked the format of the conference with a 5 minute description of the paper followed by questions and discussion.

We received excellent comments both during the presentation and in information discussions afterward.

Clio provides a unique format for intelligent discussion, it is always immensely helpful.

I received detailed comments and suggestions regarding the methods I had used to analyze my data. My paper presented measures of ownership concentration of early corporations which were somewhat ad hoc, and participants at the conference suggested some much more systematic and rigorous methods for measuring and analyzing this phenomenon. In addition, the participants at the conference subjected my work to a number of pointed and well-informed questions, which helped sharpen my understanding of my topic and enabled me to refine and improve my paper.

Greatly. Having so many good comments and feedback in so little span of time is one of the greatest things of Cliometrics

As usual, very helpful comments and suggestions from an engaged audience, most of whom had clearly read the paper in advance

I had already presented this paper a number of times before presenting at Clio. It was my job market paper, so I had presented upwards of 25 times over this year and last. The feedback that I received at Clio gave me the confidence to submit the paper and to shoot high. As a young person (junior faculty), I had a sense that the senior folks at Clio took their mentoring role seriously. A number of them came up to me over the weekend to ask where I was planning to submit the paper and to offer advice.

I got very useful feedback from the audience that will help me strengthen the paper.

Critical comments on the work were as good as receiving several thorough referee reports. I was also forced to think through and defend my choices. Sometimes I did not have good answers to the questions, which forced me to reconsider my arguments, strengthening the work.

We got a tremendous amount of feedback both during the presentation as well as throughout the 2 days of the conference. Compared to other conference, I can safely say this was the best feedback I have ever received at a conference. The comments and ideas have greatly improved the empirical work and argument of the paper.

Helped us to see how our relatively large, data intensive project can usefully be 'chopped up' into papers. Unusually careful reading by 40+ very smart colleagues led to questions that will have an impact on fine-tuning many important issues, ranging from large conceptual themes to the finer

2a). How did the presentation at the Cliometrics Conference help your work?

points of interpretation of our econometric results. Probably most importantly, this audience seemed an ideal forum to test out a project, which involves a methodological departure from the literature in this area. It allowed us to discuss in depth the advantages (and challenges) of our approach over traditional approaches. Last but not least it allowed us to make our work known to some of the best people in our field.

This was the first time I attended the Cliometrics Conference, and I have to say that it was probably the most fruitful and engaging conference I have ever attended. The format of short introductions and long Questions & Answers is ideal, in my opinion, since it prioritizes depth rather than breadth. I greatly appreciated the diverse and candid comments and suggestions. Most helpful were: 1) comments that emphasized gaps in the argument of the current draft of the paper; 2) comments from area/period specialists that suggested additional empirical material to bolster the argument as it stands; and 3) comments that helped to identify issues that we thought were problematic, but which turned out to be less important.

I have revised my paper substantially.

THE COMMENTS I RECEIVED DURING MY PRESENTATION WERE USEFUL, BUT THE INFORMAL COMMENTS I RECEIVED THROUGH DISCUSSIONS OUTSIDE OF THE PRESENTATION WERE EVEN MORE HELPFUL. I FOUND THE GROUP TO BE WARM AND WELCOMING AND INTERESTED GENERALLY IN DISCUSSING MY PAPER AND RELATED WORK.

The participants offered several very useful directions to take the paper and also pointed me towards several areas of existing literature that I was unfamiliar with but will be helpful.

This was my first public presentation of new work. The comments were very helpful in that they convinced me that I was on the right track.

great help